

**CITY OF DELAWARE  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
AGENDA**

**CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS  
1 SOUTH SANDUSKY STREET  
SEPTEMBER 2, 2015, 3:00 P.M.**

1. ROLL CALL
2. APPROVAL OF THE AUGUST 5, 2015 MOTION SUMMARY AS RECORDED AND TRANSCRIBED.
3. EXTEND THE FIREFIGHTER LIST
4. AMEND THE POLICE OFFICER LIST
5. PUBLIC COMMENTS
6. COMMITTEE COMMENTS
7. ADJOURNMENT

**MOTION SUMMARY  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
AUGUST 5, 2015**

ITEM 1. ROLL CALL

Jack Hilborn called the meeting to order at 3:00 pm.

Members Present: Jack Hilborn, April Nelson and Michael Robinson, and City Council Representative Lisa Keller

Staff Present: City Attorney Darren Shulman, Human Resource Manager Jessica Feller, Fire Chief John Donahue, and Police Chief Bruce Pijanowski

ITEM 2. APPROVAL of the Motion Summary of the Civil Service Commission meeting held JULY 13, 2015, as recorded and transcribed.

**Motion:** Mr. Robinson moved to approve of the Motion Summary for the July 13 Motion Summary, seconded by Ms. Nelson. Motion passed by a 3-0 vote.

ITEM 3. Amend the Police Officer List

**Motion:** Ms. Nelson moved to approve of the amended Police Officer List, seconded by Mr. Hilborn. Motion passed by a 3-0 vote.

ITEM 4. Presentation of the FD Promotional Hold List.

There is one (1) name on the hold list for the position of Captain. Six (6) applied and tested for the position and one (1) passed the examination. The list will be good for one (1) year from the date posted

ITEM 4. Approval of the Firefighter hiring process

Proposals have been broken down to ten (10) separate proposals that can be voted on separately, or together. Joe Murphy, Firefighter and Local 606 President spoke out in regards to the proposals on the physical agility test, part-time process, and paramedic points. Joe states he feels the CPAT and the Firefighter Mile have lesser standards than the City's physical agility and that there could be increased liability with multiple tests being offered. Joe states there is no clear way to make fair and unbiased decisions regarding the process of hiring part time firefighters. Joe also states he believes the paramedic points proposed are too high.

**Proposal #1:** Both parties agree on Proposal #1. April moves to approve. Mike seconds.

**Proposal #2:** Mike moves to approve the proposal with the contingency that the City develop standards for accepting, evaluating and approving hardship applications. April seconds.

**Proposal #3:** Both parties agree on Proposal #3. April moves to approve. Jack seconds.

**Proposal #4:** April moves to approve. Mike seconds.

**Proposal #5:** Mike moves to approve. April seconds. April states she does not approve taking the physical off site due to the merit of being able to establish a personal relationship and connection with the candidates. April would like to see the City's physical agility validated. Chief Donahue believes this would be in the budget for next year. Jack likes the physical agility as it is and has concerns regarding other tests meeting our standards but also shares the concern of our test not being validated. April states diversity within our fire department is a valid issue and there may be other reasons behind the lack of diversity in our fire department. Jack offers to make an amendment to approve the proposal as presented, with the understanding that the Commission feels the City's agility should be validated and urges the Chief to proceed with seeking a supplemental to do so this year. Darren recommends approving this proposal through the end of January, 2016. Jack moves to amend the proposal of approval through January, 2016 with an encouragement to the Chief to move forward with seeking a supplemental to validate the City's current physical agility. Mike seconds.

Joe states his belief that the Chief could move forward with the supplemental without permitting the additional testing. Jack feels allowing additional testing permits additional safeguards. Joe disagrees and feels the additional testing could cause issues regarding the City's physical agility being non-validated. Darren states from a legal standpoint, candidates are being provided several fair and equal choices for taking the physical agility. Mike Gamble, City Firefighter, states the physical experience of taking the City's physical agility made all the difference to him in choosing this department. Ron Nist, retired City Firefighter states the City's physical agility has been in existence for approximately forty (40) years and was developed by on duty firefighters at the time. It is understood the process to validate this test is lengthy and expensive. April moves and Mike seconds to approve # 5 as amended to strike outside testing.

**Proposal #6:** April moves to approve. Mike seconds.

**Proposal #7:** April moves to approve. Mike seconds.

**Proposal #8:** Mike moves to accept the proposal as amended to reflect five (5) points for paramedic. April seconds.

**Proposal #9:** Mike moves to approve. April seconds. Joe questions the interviewing process. Chief Donahue states there are no changes in the interview process. Joe states there is no longer Union opposition to this Proposal.

**Proposal #10:** April moves to approve. Jack seconds. April would like to withdraw her move to approve and vote to strike it down. April states the part time language is not necessary to add to the overall firefighter recruitment

process. Darren states the importance of this language is the clarity it provides to how the part time firefighter position can move into a full time position. This proposal provides limitations to internal transfers by the Chief, and creates a process that is transparent. Jack approves. The motion fails 1-2.

**Motion:** Ms. Nelson moved to approve Proposal #1, seconded by Mr. Robinson. Motion passed by a 3-0 vote.

**Motion:** Mr. Robinson moved to approve Proposal #2 with a contingency agreement, seconded by Ms. Nelson. Motion passed by a 3-0 vote.

**Motion:** Ms. Nelson moved to approve Proposal #3, seconded by Mr. Hilborn. Motion passed by a 3-0 vote.

**Motion:** Ms. Nelson moved to approve Proposal #4, seconded by Mr. Robinson. Motion passed by a 3-0 vote.

**Motion:** Ms. Nelson moved to approve Proposal #5 as amended to strike outside physical agility testing, seconded by Mr. Robinson. Motion passed by a 3-0 vote.

**Motion:** Ms. Nelson moved to approve Proposal #6, seconded by Mr. Robinson. Motion passed by a 3-0 vote.

**Motion:** Ms. Nelson moved to approve Proposal #7, seconded by Mr. Robinson. Motion passed by a 3-0 vote.

**Motion:** Mr. Robinson moved to approve Proposal #8 as amended to reflect five (5) additional points for paramedic certification, seconded by Ms. Nelson. Motion passed by a 3-0 vote.

**Motion:** Mr. Robinson moved to approve Proposal #9, seconded by Ms. Nelson. Motion passed by a 3-0 vote.

**Motion:** Mr. Hilborn moved to approve Proposal #10. Motion failed by a 2-1 vote.

#### ITEM 6. PUBLIC COMMENT

Nick Hrdy, Firefighter, voices a complaint about the Fire Lieutenant hiring process that was posted on 2/11/15. The recruiting resulted in the posting going external due to the lack of internal applicants. The issue discussed is the clarity of the requirement of an Associate's Degree. Darren states this issue is being discussed and clarified with the IAFF. Nick states he believes the

fire department had qualified candidates and that it was a knee jerk reaction to seek outside candidates.

ITEM 7. COMMISSION MEMBERS COMMENTS

ITEM 7. MEETING ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Hilborn adjourned the meeting at 4:35 p.m.

---

Jack Hilborn, Chairman

---

Julie Williams, Clerk

**Firefighter Certified List (2013)**

Current List Order	Original List Order	Last Name	First Name	Overall Score (for CSC eligibility list)	Candidate Status as of March 5, 2014 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of April 2, 2014 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of July 2, 2014 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of Nov. 5, 2014 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of Jan. 7, 2015 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of Feb. 4, 2015 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of March 4, 2015 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of Sept. 2, 2015 CSC Meeting
1	17	Gorman	Michael	80.67			in process	Hold	Hold	hold	hold	passed over
2	18	Spurlock	Aaron	80.00			in process	Hold	Hold	hold	hold	passed over
3	19	Rieser	Adam	79.67			in process	Hold	Hold	hold	hold	passed over
4	21	Anderson	Lance	79.00						in process	in process	passed over
5	24	Defluffer	Dale	77.67						in process	in process	in process
6	26	Rella	David	77.33							in process	in process
7	27	Moore	Robert	76.33							in process	in process
8	28	Joseph	Conrad	75.67							in process	in process
9	29	Nelson	Jared	75.33							in process	in process
10	30	Payne	Stephen	75.00							in process	in process
11	31	Rutherford	Jacob	74.67							in process	in process
<b>Hired/Removed from List/Disqualified</b>												
	4	Richison	Peter	90.67	requested to be removed from process.							
	3	Curtiss	Daniel	90.67		reached age limit						
	1	Pershing	John	95.00	in process	Recommended for hire	Hired 6/4/14					
	2	Nethers	Richard	92.00	in process	Recommended for hire	Hired 6/4/14					
	5	Theisen	Michael	90.33	in process	Recommended for hire	Hired 6/4/14					
	6	Blythe	Dylan	89.67	in process	Recommended for hire	Hired 6/4/14					
	7	Seiffert	Luke	89.33	in process	Recommended for hire	Hired 6/4/14					
	8	Drenik	Jared	88.00	in process	Recommended for hire	Hired 6/4/14					
	11	Caulkins	Patrick	84.00	in process	Recommended for hire	Hired 6/4/14					
												requested to be removed from process; accepted position elsewhere.
	12	Jacobs	Kyle	83.67	in process	Hold	Hold					

**City of Delaware  
Firefighter Certified List (2013)**

Current List Order	Original List Order	Last Name	First Name	Overall Score (for CSC eligibility list)	Candidate Status as of March 5, 2014 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of April 2, 2014 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of July 2, 2014 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of Nov. 5, 2014 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of Jan. 7, 2015 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of Feb. 4, 2015 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of March 4, 2015 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of Sept. 2, 2015 CSC Meeting
	9	Howard	Ryan	87.33	in process	passed over	Hold	in process	Hired 12/17/14			
	13	VonLohr	Taylor	83.33	in process	Hold	Hold	in process	Hired 12/17/14			
	14	Ripley	Joshua	83.00	in process	Hold	Hold	in process	recommended for removal from list			
	16	Hagstad	Benjamin	82.00	in process	Hold	Hold	in process	Hired 12/17/14			
	10	Nighland	Christopher	86.33	in process	passed over	Hold	passed over	passed over 3rd time; removed from list			
	25	Simon	Jeff	77.33						requested to be removed from list; accepted position elsewhere.		
	22	McNary	Christopher	79.00							requested to be removed from list; accepted position elsewhere.	
	20	Penner	Caleb	79.67							in process	
	23	May	Benjamin	78.67							in process	Hired 8/26/15
											in process	Hired 8/26/15
	15	Dunlap	Mark	82.33	in process	Hold	Hold	passed over	passed over		hold	passed over 3rd time; removed from list

Updated list certified by the Civil Service Commission on the 5th day of September, 2015.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Jack Hilborn  
Chairman, Civil Service Commission

City of Delaware  
Police Officer Certified List (2014)

Original List Order	Current List Order	Candidate	Avg. Interview Score	Written Exam Score	COMBINED SCORE	Military Points	Eq. Points	Certified Status Points	OVERALL SCORE (for CSC eligibility list)	Date Placed on Certified List	Roll-off Date (if placed on list) (unless extended)	Candidate Status as of Feb. 2, 2015 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of May 3, 2015 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of June 15, 2015 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of July 13, 2015 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of Sept. 2, 2015 CSC Meeting	
1	1	John Young	75.00	88.67	82.34		2	2	86.34	5/6/2015	5/6/2016	added to list	added to list			passed over	
2	2	Michael Barnes	76.20	90.22	83.21	1	2	2	86.21	5/6/2015	5/6/2016	added to list	added to list			passed over	
3	3	Alison Castrilla	75.60	84.24	79.92		2	2	83.92	5/6/2015	5/6/2016	added to list	added to list			passed over	
4	4	Jeffrey Ford	76.20	86.96	81.58		2	2	83.58	5/6/2015	5/6/2016	added to list	added to list			passed over	
5	5	Alex Yarnell	75.40	86.41	80.91		2	1	82.91	5/6/2015	5/6/2016	added to list	added to list			in process	
6	6	Timothy Pile	75.40	83.7	79.55		2	1	82.55	5/6/2015	5/6/2016	added to list	added to list				
7	7	Joseph Miller	77.20	84.78	80.99	1		1	81.99	5/6/2015	5/6/2016	added to list	added to list				
8	8	Roman Sosa	75.80	84.78	80.29	1		1	81.29	5/6/2015	5/6/2016	added to list	added to list				
9	9	Steven Croushore	75.60	84.78	80.19			1	81.19	5/6/2015	5/6/2016	added to list	added to list				
10	10	Jordan Cornwell	76.80	80.98	78.89		2		80.89	5/6/2015	5/6/2016	added to list	added to list				
Hired/Removal from List/Disqualified																	
1		Joshua Curtis	81.8	91.85	85.825	1	2		89.83	9/3/2014		accepted position elsewhere					
6		Jacob Smith	77.6	88.04	82.82			2	84.82	9/3/2014		accepted position elsewhere					
5		Michael Adams	78.2	88.59	83.895	1		1	85.80	9/3/2014		hired 2-18-15					
9		Benjamin Sholl	81	81.52	81.26	1	2		84.26	9/3/2014		hired 1-14-15					
8		Dana Jaggor	75.2	85.33	80.265		2	2	84.27	9/3/2014		recommended for removal from list					
11		Chris Schofield	77.8	84.24	81.02	1			82.02	9/3/2014		recommended for removal from list					
8		Matthew Raibde	81.40	80.98	81.19		2	2	85.19	5/6/2015	5/6/2016	added to list	withdrew from process			withdrew from process	
12		Allen Salyers	81.20	79.89	80.55	1		2	83.55	5/6/2015	5/6/2016	added to list	withdrew from process			withdrew from process	
7		Kenneth Okine	83.00	81.52	82.26		3		85.26	5/6/2015	5/6/2016	added to list	withdrew from process			withdrew from process	
13		Tyler Brewer	76.40	83.7	80.05		1	2	83.05	5/6/2015	5/6/2016	added to list	withdrew from process			withdrew from process	
6		Ryan Sulphur	81.80	81.52	81.66	1	2	1	85.66	5/6/2015	5/6/2016	added to list	withdrew from process			withdrew from process	
2		Garret Lotz	75.20	90.22	82.71				82.71	5/6/2015	5/6/2016	added to list	withdrew from process			withdrew from process	
3		Lance McDaniel	85.00	85.33	85.17	1	3		89.17	9/3/2014	9/3/2015	passed over 2 times				accept position elsewhere	
4		Braden Peters	80.40	86.59	84.50		2		86.50	9/3/2014	9/3/2015	passed over 2 times				accept position elsewhere	
4		John Chiriac	77.60	86.96	82.28		2	2	86.28	9/3/2014	9/3/2015	passed over 2 times				passed over 3 times; expired	
7		Jason Cannoli	75.60	83.15	79.38		2	2	83.38	5/6/2016	5/6/2016	passed over 2 times				passed over 3 times; expired	
10		Anthony Pizzi	77.00	83.7	80.35		2	2	84.35	9/3/2014	9/3/2015	passed over				passed over 3 times; expired	
12		Chris Willis	75.20	83.7	79.45		2	2	83.45	9/3/2014	9/3/2015	passed over				passed over 3 times; expired	
13		Jeff Hodman	77.75	83.15	80.45	1			81.45	9/3/2014	9/3/2015	passed over				passed over 3 times; expired	
13		Max Muir	76.20	83.15	80.68				80.68	9/3/2014	9/3/2015	passed over				passed over 3 times; expired	
14		Kevin Kline	76.00	84.78	80.39				80.39	9/3/2014	9/3/2015	passed over				passed over 3 times; expired	
15		David Evinsky	75.00	79.89	77.45		2		79.45	9/3/2014	9/3/2015	passed over				passed over 3 times; expired	
16		Elise Smith	76.20	78.69	78.05				78.05	9/3/2014	9/3/2015	passed over				passed over 3 times; expired	

List Certified on the 2nd day of September, 2015, by the Civil Service Commission.

Jack Hilborn  
Chairman, Civil Service Commission