

**CITY OF DELAWARE  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
AGENDA**

**CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS  
1 SOUTH SANDUSKY STREET  
AUGUST 5, 2015, 3:00 P.M.**

1. ROLL CALL
2. APPROVAL OF THE JULY 13, 2015 MOTION SUMMARY AS RECORDED AND TRANSCRIBED.
3. AMEND THE POLICE OFFICER LIST
4. PRESENTATION OF THE FD PROMOTIONAL HOLD LIST
5. APPROVAL OF THE FIREFIGHTER HIRING PROCESS
6. PUBLIC COMMENTS
7. COMMITTEE COMMENTS
8. ADJOURNMENT

**MOTION SUMMARY  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
JULY 13, 2015**

**1. ROLL CALL**

Julie William called roll.

Members Present: Jack Hilborn, April Nelson and Michael Robinson  
Jack Hilborn called the meeting to order at 3:05pm.

Staff Present: City Attorney Darren Shulman, City Manager Tom Homan, Human Resource Manager Jessica Feller, Fire Chief John Donahue, Police Chief Bruce Pijanowski

**2. APPROVAL OF THE MOTION SUMMARIES OF THE REGULAR MEETINGS OF CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION HELD JUNE 15, 2015, AS RECORDED AND TRANSCRIBED.**

**MOTION:** On a motion made by Michael and seconded by April the vote to approve of the motion summaries as presented was unanimously approved by a 3-0 vote.

**3. AMEND THE POLICE OFFICER LIST**

Three (3) names have been removed. Kenneth Okine self removed. Tyler Brewer and Ryan Sutphin have been removed as a result of background issues.

**MOTION:** On a motion made by April and seconded by Michael the vote to approve the amendment of the police officer certified list was unanimously approved by a 3-0 vote.

**4. PRESENT THE FIREFIGHTER HIRING PROCESS PROPOSALS**

Tom Homan presents his memorandum on the Implementation of a Part-Time Firefighter Hiring Program. John Donahue presents the final draft of the Part-Time Firefighter Program and Firefighter Hiring Process and addresses questions.

1. Qualifications-recommending EMT certifications to be accepted.
2. Costs- Paramedic certification-\$4,984. Written test is \$40 and \$7 for each additional one. CPAT agility \$125 and Firefighter Mile agility is \$60 and \$90 and they are good for one year. The current written test is \$10. The in-house agility has no cost to the candidate.
3. Scoring -The written exam score will account for 50% of total. There will be multiple written exam dates and scores will be accepted on a continual basis.
4. Physical agility- three (3) tests are being recommended.
  1. City Physical Agility Test
  2. Candidate Physical Aptitude (CPAT)
  3. Firefighter Mile

The goal is to have a validated test as the current physical agility done in house is not validated and could be challenged on validity and fairness. A complete assessment done by a 3<sup>rd</sup> party that would be based on current job

descriptions, runs, timelines, etc. would need to be done to validate the current agility test.

5. Oral interview score to account for 50% of final score with a passing score of 75%.
6. Additional points for paramedic certification is 10.
7. If no full-time position exists, candidates may be offered a part-time position.

A meeting between the Chief and the Firefighters resulted in changes being made based upon grounds that were agreed upon. The part-time firefighter program has been approved by the City. The Civil Service Commission is now tasked with approving the recruitment process.

Joe Murphy, Firefighter and President of the Local IAFF presented a PowerPoint presentation outlining the portions of the proposed process the local IAFF take opposing positions on to include:

1. The increase of paramedic certification points.
2. The increased cost and change of the written examination process.
3. Oral interview percentage to account for 50% and the possibility of Skype being utilized.
4. Physical agility and the number of offered tests, and increased costs to candidates.
5. Hiring part-time firefighters and the potential negative impact on full time applicants. A potential increase in cost to part-time firefighters, and a concern of the City reducing full-time fighters.

April Nelson states if there are local hiring issues, they could be coming from in-house issues. April challenges the Firefighters and the Chief to take a look at what those might be.

Jim Oberle, Firefighter, proposes two (2) different lists; One (1) for part-time firefighters candidates and one (1) for full-time candidates. Candidates could be on both lists.

Tom Homan expressed the importance of the part-time program and the commitment to hire full-time firefighters first. The program offers the opportunity to hire full-time firefighters from part-time. The City's last two (2) firefighters hired were part-time firefighters elsewhere. The program can, and has worked, in jurisdictions such as Washington Township and Dublin where firefighters have to come through a part-time internship prior to being hired full time. It gives a good perspective for evaluating potential full-time employees.

Joe Murphy distributes the City of Piqua Fire Department Part-Time Staffing Evaluation and refers specifically to page 23 "City of Delaware Consultation-Failed Part-Time Program". April states the program was under Chief Macklin and is a different one altogether. The date of the evaluation was 2010 and comments based within are based on concerns of the past. The issues of concern have been addressed with this program.

April states that in regards to the physical agility test, she is in favor of validating the current test. There is value in our staff doing the test and seeing candidates-seeing the quality of the candidates and participating in providing the encouragement. Darren Shulman notes this also adds a wrinkle of danger in what people are doing subjectively. April states she does not have a problem with taking the written examination to another 3<sup>rd</sup> party administrator.

Jack states that he would like to see the firefighters and City staff come together again to come to a closer agreement on the proposals.

Darren states there is no more movement to be made on the paramedic certification as changes have been made by the City to get closer to an agreement. In regards to the physical agility, the City is proposing several be offered and to do an evaluation of the best process. Otherwise, there would be candidates who would be missing out on the opportunity when for various reasons are unable to make the in-house physical agility. The hiring of part-time firefighters is not likely one that can be agreed upon. The City has selected a method that is a fair hiring process.

Joe agrees there are three (3) major issues in dispute.

Jack Hilborn states he would like a draft of those three (3) issues be brought together before the Commission. It is understood and agreed by both parties that the three (3) structural issues are not likely to be agreed upon.

**6. PUBLIC COMMENT**

There was no additional public comment.

**7. COMMISSION MEMBERS COMMENT**

**8. MEETING ADJOURNMENT**

Chairman Hilborn adjourned the meeting at 4:45 p.m.

---

Jack Hilborn, Chairman

---

Julie Williams, Secretary

**Julie Williams**

---

**Subject:** FW: Delaware P.D. background packet

**From:** Garret Lotz <[red0082@gmail.com](mailto:red0082@gmail.com)>  
**Date:** July 10, 2015 at 4:13:03 PM EDT  
**To:** Bruce Pijanowski <[bpijanowski@delawareohio.net](mailto:bpijanowski@delawareohio.net)>  
**Subject:** Re: Delaware P.D. background packet

Chief Bruce Pijanowski,  
I Garret S Lotz would like to formally withdraw from consideration for the position of police officer with the City of Delaware Ohio. I have accepted a full time position elsewhere. Thanks.

Sent from my iPhone

On Jul 2, 2015, at 1:51 PM, Bruce Pijanowski <[bpijanowski@delawareohio.net](mailto:bpijanowski@delawareohio.net)> wrote:

Garret,

As we discussed, our background packet and waiver form are attached.  
If you decide to take your talents elsewhere, just return an email to me indicating that you are no longer interested in our process. If you are interested, fill out the attached and get it back to me as soon as possible.

Good luck either way!

Bruce Pijanowski, CLEE  
Chief of Police  
Delaware Police Department  
70 N. Union St.  
Delaware, OH 43015  
(740) 203-1101

Approved Date: Sept. 3, 2014

City of Delaware  
Police Officer Certified List (2014)

Expiration Date: Continuous

Original List Order	Current List Order	Candidate	Avg. Interview Score	Written Exam Score	COMBINED SCORE	Military Points	Edu. Points	Certified Status Points	OVERALL SCORE (for CSC eligibility list)	Date Placed on Certified List	Roll-off Date (1 yr. from date placed on list unless extended)	Candidate Status as of Feb. 2, 2015 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of May 8, 2015 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of June 15, 2015 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of July 13, 2015 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of Aug. 5, 2015 CSC Meeting
2	1	Lance McDaniel	85.00	85.33	85.17	1	3		89.17	9/3/2014	9/3/2015	passed over 2 times				
3	2	Braden Peters	80.40	88.59	84.50		2		86.50	9/3/2014	9/3/2015	passed over 2 times				
A1	3	John Young	75.00	89.67	82.34		2	2	86.34	5/6/2015	5/6/2016		added to list			
4	4	John Chiriac	77.60	86.96	82.28		2	2	86.28	9/3/2014	9/3/2015	passed over 2 times				
A2	5	Michael Barnes	76.20	90.22	83.21	1	2		86.21	5/6/2015	5/6/2016		added to list			
7	6	Anthony Pizzi	77.00	83.7	80.35		2	2	84.35	9/3/2014	9/3/2015	passed over				
A6	7	Alison Castrilla	75.60	84.24	79.92		2	2	83.92	5/6/2015	5/6/2016		added to list			
A7	8	Jeffrey Ford	76.20	86.96	81.58			2	83.58	5/6/2015	5/6/2016		added to list			
10	9	Chris Willis	75.20	83.7	79.45		2	2	83.45	9/3/2014	9/3/2015					
A9	10	Jason Carroll	75.60	83.15	79.38		2	2	83.38	5/6/2016	5/6/2016		added to list			
A11	11	Alex Yarnell	75.40	86.41	80.91			2	82.91	5/6/2015	5/6/2016		added to list			
A13	12	Timothy Pike	75.40	83.7	79.55		2	1	82.55	5/6/2015	5/6/2016		added to list			
A14	13	Joseph Miller	77.20	84.78	80.99	1			81.99	5/6/2015	5/6/2016		added to list			
12	14	Jeff Hoffman	77.75	83.15	80.45	1			81.45	9/3/2014	9/3/2015					
A15	15	Roman Sena	75.80	84.78	80.29	1			81.29	5/6/2015	5/6/2016		added to list			
A16	16	Steven Croushore	75.60	84.78	80.19			1	81.19	5/6/2015	5/6/2016		added to list			
A17	17	Jordan Cornwell	76.80	80.98	78.89		2		80.89	5/6/2015	5/6/2016		added to list			
13	18	Max Muir	78.20	83.15	80.68				80.68	9/3/2014	9/3/2015					
14	19	Kevin Kline	76.00	84.78	80.39				80.39	9/3/2014	9/3/2015					
15	20	David Evinsky	75.00	79.89	77.45		2		79.45	9/3/2014	9/3/2015					
16	21	Elise Smith	76.20	79.89	78.05				78.05	9/3/2014	9/3/2015					
Hired/Removed from List/Disqualified																
1		Joshua Curtis	81.8	91.85	86.825	1	2		89.83	9/3/2014		accepted position elsewhere				
6		Jacob Smith	77.6	88.04	82.82			2	84.82	9/3/2014		accepted position elsewhere				

Approved Date: Sept. 3, 2014

**City of Delaware  
Police Officer Certified List (2014)**

Expiration Date: Continuous

5	Michael Adams	79.2	88.59	83.895	1		1	85.90	9/3/2014		hired; 2-18-15				
9	Benjamin Sholl	81	81.52	81.26	1	2		84.26	9/3/2014		hired 1-14-15				
8	Dana Jagger	75.2	85.33	80.265		2	2	84.27	9/3/2014		recommended for removal from list				
11	Chris Schofield	77.8	84.24	81.02	1			82.02	9/3/2014		recommended for removal from list				
A5	Matthew Rahde	81.40	80.98	81.19			2	85.19	5/6/2015	5/6/2016		added to list	withdrew from process	withdrew from process	
12	Allen Salyers	81.20	79.89	80.55	1		2	83.55	5/6/2015	5/6/2016		added to list	withdrew from process	withdrew from process	
A4	Kenneth Okine	83.00	81.52	82.26			3	85.26	5/6/2015	5/6/2016		added to list		withdrew from process	
13	Tyler Brewer	76.40	83.7	80.05		1	2	83.05	5/6/2015	5/6/2016		added to list		recommended for removal from list	
A3	Ryan Sutphin	81.80	81.52	81.66	1	2	1	85.66	5/6/2015	5/6/2016		added to list		recommended for removal from list	
A12	Garret Lotz	75.20	90.22	82.71				82.71	5/6/2015	5/6/2016		added to list			withdrew from process

List Certified on the 5th day of August, 2015, by the Civil Service Commission.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Jack Hilborn  
Chairman, Civil Service Commission

1 Addition of 17 names on May 6, 2015 (A1-A17).  
2



Fire Department

## 2015 - Promotional Hold List

**Effective Date:** July 16, 2015  
**Expiration Date:** July 16, 2016

**Captain**  
Erik Zierden

**Lieutenant**  
None

**The Promotional Process List is to be used as outlined in SOP #1.1.10 Acting Officer.**

The Promotional Hold List is created as part of the 2015 Fire Department Captain and Lieutenant promotional process approved by the Civil Service Commission.

From the written examination results, the Civil Service "Rule of 3" is not able to be obtained. The Civil Service promotional process that was approved will continue to be used for any open positions.

## 2015 Fire Fighter Recruitment Process

July, 2015

- 1) Seek Civil Service Commission approval for recruitment process changes
- 2) Qualifications for Applicants
  - a. Minimum age is 18 at the time of appointment.
  - b. Age limit is 40 at the time of appointment.
  - c. Possession of a high school diploma or GED.
  - d. Ohio FF-2 certification at time of application.
  - e. Ohio Paramedic certification at time of application. Candidates who hold an out of state certification or national registry must coordinate with the Ohio Department of Public Safety concerning reciprocity, which must be completed prior to hire.
  - f. Must be a United States citizen or hold a permanent resident card.
- 3) Written Exam
  - a. To be provided by a reputable professional testing service for an entry level fire fighter applicant.
  - b. Applicants shall be responsible for the full cost of the test.
    - i. Applicants meeting certain requirements may be eligible for hardship fee waiver. It is the City's sole discretion to offer and approve or deny a hardship fee waiver.
  - c. A minimum score of 75% is considered passing.
  - d. Accounts for 50% of overall score.
  - e. Multiple testing dates may be made available.
  - f. The City may accept test scores on a continual basis.
  - g. Up to the top 60 highest scoring candidates (and ties) will move on to the Physical Agility Assessment.
  - h. When a candidate is selected to move on to additional phases of the process, their score will no longer be eligible for future consideration if the candidate fails to successfully complete those phases (for example, physical agility, oral exam, completion of background check). In order to be eligible for future consideration, the candidate must retake the written test and reapply.
- 4) Physical Agility Assessment
  - a. Up to the top 60 highest scoring candidates (and ties) will be invited to participate in the Physical Agility Assessment pursuant to department hiring needs.
  - b. Through calendar year 2016, candidates must either pass the physical agility assessment conducted by the Delaware Fire Department or submit proof of successful completion of one of the approved Physical Agility Assessments within the previous 12 months from the date of their application for employment. Candidates who choose to submit an approved third party physical agility assessment must submit proof of satisfactory completion prior to the date of the

Proposal #1

Proposal #2

Proposal #3

Proposal #4

Proposal #5

assessment conducted by the City.

- c. Passing the physical agility assessment does not necessarily guarantee an interview.
- d. Approved physical agility assessments (candidates must successfully complete one of the following):
  - i. Delaware Fire Department Physical Agility Assessment:
    - 1. Candidates will be required to pass all stages of the assessment.
    - 2. The Fire Chief will review the agility stages annually to determine what is necessary and useful.
    - 3. The Fire Department will provide up to 3 practice sessions on the three prior Saturdays leading up to the test date.

Proposal #6

ii. Third Party Validated Physical Agility Assessments. The following assessments have received validation as acceptable testing processes designed to evaluate the duties of a fire fighter.

Proposal #5 (cont)

- 1. Candidate Physical Aptitude Test – this test is created by the IAFF/IAFC Fire Service Joint Labor Management.
- 2. Firefighter Mile – this test is conducted by Ergometrics and has been adopted by Columbus Fire Department and is in the process of being adopted by the Ohio Fire Academy.
- 3. Any additional third party assessments must be approved by the Commission prior to being accepted.
- 4. Any costs associated with third party testing are the candidate's responsibility.

- 5) Self-background Report to be completed by candidates who have successfully passed the Physical Agility Assessment.
- 6) Oral Panel Interviews will be comprised of a standardized set of questions.
  - a. Oral Panel Interviews will be scheduled according to department hiring needs.
  - b. Oral Panel Interview representatives will be provided appropriate training by DAS staff.

- c. Candidates must obtain a minimum passing score of ~~75% 70%~~.
- d. ~~Accounts for 50% of the candidate's overall score~~
- e. Interview panel to consist of:<sup>2</sup>

Formatted: Strikethrough

Proposal #7

- i. Fire Chief and/or Assistant Fire Chief
- ii. Fire Captain and/or Lieutenant
- iii. Fire Fighter
- iv. DAS representative
- v. Citizen
- f. The City will establish a pool of citizen volunteers interested in serving on the

<sup>1</sup> Prior to the end of 2016, staff will present the Commission with a report on the third-party physical agility assessment. This report will detail the number of candidates who chose each agility assessment option, the number of candidates hired under each option, and candidates' performance during their probationary period. The Commission will then consider whether to continue accepting third-party physical agility assessment results. If no action is taken by the Commission, or the Commission determines to end the practice, the City will cease accepting third-party physical agility assessment results at the end of 2016.

<sup>2</sup> Interviews will be scheduled as necessary to fill vacancies that exist. The City will endeavor to maintain the same panel representatives throughout each grouping of interviews in order to ensure consistency in scoring for a particular group.

interview panel. Applicants will be screened and if deemed acceptable, placed into the pool. The City may proceed with interviews *without* the citizen panelist if one of the following occurs:

- i. The City is unable to schedule one of the members from the interview panel pool.
- ii. A member of the pool who has agreed to be part of the panel cancels within two weeks of the scheduled interviews.
- iii. The City is unable to find any acceptable volunteers for the pool.
- g. Interviews will be scheduled as necessary to fill vacancies that exist. The City will endeavor to maintain the same panel representatives throughout each grouping of interviews in order to ensure consistency in scoring for a particular group. If a member of the interview panel is unable to attend on a particular day, interviews will proceed without that member.

Proposal #7 (cont)

- 7) Ranking will be based on the candidate's written exam score and average panel interview score plus additional points for the following (note: Additional Points must be completed at the time of the panel interview, not in process of being completed).

a. Certification:

~~i. Paramedic Card = 5 pts~~

~~ii. Paramedic Card = 10 pts~~

b. Educational Points:<sup>3</sup>

i. Associate Degree = 1 pt

ii. Bachelor's Degree = 2 pts

iii. Master's Degree = 3 pts

~~iv. Doctorate = 6 pts~~

c. Military Points:

i. Honorable discharge, active duty or current reserve status = 1 pt

Proposal #8

Formatted: Strikethrough

Proposal #9

- 8) Provide initial list for certification by the Civil Service Commission. Thereafter, provide additions to the eligible list for certification by the Civil Service Commission.

- 9) Completion of Background Assessment and Waiver
- 10) Background check and BCI/FBI Fingerprinting
- 11) Completion of Fire Fighter Index (FFI) and Emotional Intelligence Index (EII)
- 12) Polygraph (non-medical)<sup>4</sup>
- 13) Interview with Fire Chief
- 14) Recommendation for hire to City Manager
- 15) Interview with the City Manager and issuance of conditional offer
- 16) Full psychological evaluation
- 17) Pension physical and drug screen
- 18) Swearing In Ceremony

Tie Breakers: Once all scores are calculated and additional points added, if two or more candidates have the same score and tie for the tenth ranking, then all candidates receiving that same score shall qualify under the "Rule of Ten" regardless of the number of candidates.

<sup>3</sup> Education points awarded for highest degree achieved only.

<sup>4</sup> Polygraph examinations may be conducted prior to a conditional offer as they do not contain medical information.

**Part-time Fire Fighter Process:**

1. If no full-time vacancy exists, the Fire Chief may offer a candidate on the certified list a part-time position.
2. If a candidate declines this offer, there will be no negative consequences to them and they will remain on the certification list.
3. Because they have already been certified through the entire process, part-time fire fighters may be offered full-time positions when a vacancy opens if one of the following conditions have been met:
  - a. Successful completion of their probationary period; or
  - b. If still under probation, the part-time fire fighter's score met the rule of ten at the time the fire fighter accepted the part-time position; or
  - c. If still under probation, the part-time fire fighter's score meets the rule of ten at the time of the full-time vacancy.

Proposal #10

Approved by the Civil Service Commission on this \_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_ 2015.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Jack Hilborn  
Chairman, Civil Service Commission