



**CITY OF DELAWARE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
AGENDA**

**CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS
1 SOUTH SANDUSKY STREET
JUNE 15, 2015, 3:00 P.M.**

1. ROLL CALL
2. APPROVAL OF THE MAY 6, 2015 MOTION SUMMARY AS RECORDED AND TRANSCRIBED.
3. PRESENT THE FIREFIGHTER HIRING PROCESS PROPOSALS
4. EXTEND THE FIREFIGHTER LIST
5. PUBLIC COMMENTS
6. COMMITTEE COMMENTS
7. ADJOURNMENT

**MOTION SUMMARY
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
MAY 6, 2015**

1. ROLL CALL

Jessica Feller called roll.

Members Present: Jack Hilborn, April Nelson and Michael Robinson.
Jack Hilborn called the meeting to order at 3:00 pm.

Staff Present: City Attorney Darren Shulman, Assistant City Manager Jackie Walker, Human Resource Manager Jessica Feller, Fire Chief John Donahue, City Council Member Lisa Keller
Also Present: Firefighters Clint Archangel, Joe Jones and Jim Oberle

2. APPROVAL OF THE MOTION SUMMARIES OF THE REGULAR MEETINGS OF CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION HELD MARCH 4, 2015, AS RECORDED AND TRANSCRIBED.

MOTION: On a motion made by Michael and seconded by April the vote to table the approval of the motion summaries as presented was unanimously approved by a 3-0 vote. The minutes will be reviewed at the next meeting.

3. CERTIFY ADDITIONS TO THE POLICE OFFICER ELIGIBLE LIST

There are seventeen additions to the list and four open positions to be filled.

MOTION: On a motion made by April and seconded by Michael the additions to the police officer eligible list was unanimously approved by a 3-0 vote.

4. EXTEND AND APPROVE THE FIREFIGHTER ELIGIBLE LIST

There are three open positions to be filled and fourteen candidates on the eligible list. Chief Donahue requests the list to be extended an additional six months to December 18th. Captain Oberle questions the quality of applicants on the list based on their scores. The minimum score has been prior established in the Civil Service Rules. The candidates meet the minimum score requirement of 70%. Thirteen out of the fourteen candidates on the list scored eighty-five percent or higher on the written examination. Some of the issues associated with having a "stale list" may be addressed with the present firefighter recruitment hiring process proposals to be heard.

MOTION: On a motion made by April and seconded by Michael the extension of the firefighter certified list was unanimously approved for a thirty day period to July 18th by a 3-0 vote.

5. PRESENT FIREFIGHTER HIRING PROCESS PROPOSALS

Ten different proposals are to be presented to the firefighter recruitment process that will mirror the approved police officer recruitment process. Proposal number one will be to change the EMT B requirement to a Paramedic. The pros and cons of requiring a Paramedic qualification were discussed. Additional presentations and discussions for considerations will be held during a specially scheduled meeting prior to June 18.

6. EXECUTIVE SESSION PURSUANT TO OHIO REVISED CODE SECTION 122.22 (G)(1) PERSONNEL

MOTION: On a motion made by April and seconded by Michael the Civil Service Commission unanimously agreed to move into Executive Session at 4:21 p.m.

7. RETURN FROM EXECUTIVE SESSION

MOTION: On a motion made by April and seconded by Jack the Civil Service Commission unanimously agreed to return from Executive Session at 4:28 p.m.

8. MEETING ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Hilborn adjourned the meeting at 4:29 p.m.

Jack Hilborn, Chairman

Julie Williams, Secretary

2015 Fire Fighter Recruitment Process

April, 2015

- 1) Seek Civil Service Commission approval for recruitment process changes
- 2) Qualifications for Applicants
 - a. Minimum age is 18 at the time of appointment.
 - b. Age limit is 40 at the time of appointment.
 - c. Possession of a high school diploma or GED.
 - d. Ohio FF-2 certification at time of application.
 - e. Ohio Paramedic certification at time of application. Candidates who hold an out of state certification or national registry must coordinate with the Ohio Department of Public Safety concerning reciprocity, which must be completed prior to hire.
 - f. Must be a United States citizen or hold a permanent resident card.

Proposal #1

3) Written Exam

- a. To be provided by a reputable professional testing service for an entry level fire fighter applicant.
- b. Applicants shall be responsible for the full cost of the test.
 - i. Applicants meeting certain requirements may be eligible for hardship fee waiver. It is the City's sole discretion to offer and approve or deny a hardship fee waiver.
- c. A minimum score of 75% is considered passing.

Proposal #2

- d. Accounts for 50% of overall score.

Proposal #3

- e. Multiple testing dates may be made available.
- f. The City may accept test scores on a continual basis.

Proposal #4

- g. Up to the top 60 highest scoring candidates (and ties) will move on to the Physical Agility Assessment.
- h. When a candidate is selected to move on to additional phases of the process, their score will no longer be eligible for future consideration if the candidate fails to successfully complete those phases (for example, physical agility, oral exam, completion of background check). In order to be eligible for future consideration, the candidate must retake the written test and reapply.

4) Physical Agility Assessment

- a. Up to the top 60 highest scoring candidates (and ties) will be invited to participate in the Physical Agility Assessment pursuant to department hiring needs.
- b. Through calendar year 2016, candidates must either pass the physical agility assessment conducted by the Delaware Fire Department or submit proof of successful completion of one of the approved Physical Agility Assessments within the previous 12 months from the date of their application for employment. Candidates who choose to submit an approved third party physical agility assessment must submit proof of satisfactory completion prior to the date of the

Proposal #5

assessment conducted by the City.¹

- c. Passing the physical agility assessment does not necessarily guarantee an interview.
- d. Approved physical agility assessments (candidates must successfully complete one of the following):
 - i. Delaware Fire Department Physical Agility Assessment:
 - 1. Candidates will be required to pass all stages of the assessment.
 - 2. The Fire Chief will review the agility stages annually to determine what is necessary and useful.

Proposal #6

- 3. The Fire Department will provide up to 3 practice sessions on the three prior Saturdays leading up to the test date.

Proposal #5 (cont)

- ii. Third Party Validated Physical Agility Assessments. The following assessments have received validation as acceptable testing processes designed to evaluate the duties of a fire fighter:
 - 1. Candidate Physical Aptitude Test – this test is created by the IAFF/IAFC Fire Service Joint Labor Management.
 - 2. Firefighter Mile – this test is conducted by Ergometrics and has been adopted by Columbus Fire Department and is in the process of being adopted by the Ohio Fire Academy.
 - 3. Any additional third party assessments must be approved by the Commission prior to being accepted.
 - 4. Any costs associated with third party testing are the candidate's responsibility.

- 5) Self-background Report to be completed by candidates who have successfully passed the Physical Agility Assessment.
- 6) Oral Panel Interviews will be comprised of a standardized set of questions.
 - a. Oral Panel Interviews will be scheduled according to department hiring needs.
 - b. Oral Panel Interview representatives will be provided appropriate training by DAS staff.

Proposal #7

- c. Candidates must obtain a minimum passing score of 75%.
- d. Accounts for 50% of the candidate's overall score
- e. Interview panel to consist of:
 - i. Fire Chief and/or Assistant Fire Chief
 - ii. Fire Captain and/or Lieutenant
 - iii. Fire Fighter
 - iv. DAS representative
 - v. Citizen
- f. The City will establish a pool of citizen volunteers interested in serving on the

¹ Prior to the end of 2016, staff will present the Commission with a report on the third-party physical agility assessment. This report will detail the number of candidates who chose each agility assessment option, the number of candidates hired under each option, and candidates' performance during their probationary period. The Commission will then consider whether to continue accepting third-party physical agility assessment results. If no action is taken by the Commission, or the Commission determines to end the practice, the City will cease accepting third-party physical agility assessment results at the end of 2016.

² Interviews will be scheduled as necessary to fill vacancies that exist. The City will endeavor to maintain the same panel representatives throughout each grouping of interviews in order to ensure consistency in scoring for a particular group.

interview panel. Applicants will be screened and if deemed acceptable, placed into the pool. The City may proceed with interviews *without* the citizen panelist if one of the following occurs:

- Proposal #7 (cont)
- i. The City is unable to schedule one of the members from the interview panel pool.
 - ii. A member of the pool who has agreed to be part of the panel cancels within two weeks of the scheduled interviews.
 - iii. The City is unable to find any acceptable volunteers for the pool.
- g. Interviews will be scheduled as necessary to fill vacancies that exist. The City will endeavor to maintain the same panel representatives throughout each grouping of interviews in order to ensure consistency in scoring for a particular group. If a member of the interview panel is unable to attend on a particular day, interviews will proceed without that member.

7) Ranking will be based on the candidate's written exam score and average panel interview score plus additional points for the following (note: Additional Points must be completed at the time of the panel interview, not in process of being completed).

- Proposal #8
- a. ~~Certification:~~
 - i. ~~Paramedic Card = 5 pts~~
 - b. Educational Points:³
 - i. Associate Degree = 1 pt
 - ii. Bachelor's Degree = 2 pts
 - iii. Master's Degree = 3 pts
 - iv. ~~Doctorate = 6 pts~~
 - c. Military Points:
 - i. Honorable discharge, active duty or current reserve status = 1 pt

Proposal #9

8) Provide initial list for certification by the Civil Service Commission. Thereafter, provide additions to the eligible list for certification by the Civil Service Commission.

-
- 9) Completion of Background Assessment and Waiver
 - 10) Background check and BCI/FBI Fingerprinting
 - 11) Completion of Fire Fighter Index (FFI) and Emotional Intelligence Index (EII)
 - 12) Polygraph (non-medical)⁴
 - 13) Interview with Fire Chief
 - 14) Recommendation for hire to City Manager
 - 15) Interview with the City Manager and issuance of conditional offer
 - 16) Full psychological evaluation
 - 17) Pension physical and drug screen
 - 18) Swearing In Ceremony

Tie Breakers: Once all scores are calculated and additional points added, if two or more candidates have the same score and tie for the tenth ranking, then all candidates receiving that same score shall qualify under the "Rule of Ten" regardless of the number of candidates.

³ Education points awarded for highest degree achieved only.

⁴ Polygraph examinations may be conducted prior to a conditional offer as they do not contain medical information.

Part-time Fire Fighter Process:

1. If no full-time vacancy exists, the Fire Chief may offer a candidate on the certified list a part-time position.
2. If a candidate declines this offer, there will be no negative consequences to them and they will remain on the certification list.
3. Because they have already been certified through the entire process, part-time fire fighters may be offered full-time positions when a vacancy opens if one of the following conditions have been met:
 - a. Successful completion of their probationary period; or
 - b. If still under probation, the part-time fire fighter's score met the rule of ten at the time the fire fighter accepted the part-time position; or
 - c. If still under probation, the part-time fire fighter's score meets the rule of ten at the time of the full-time vacancy.

Proposal #10

Approved by the Civil Service Commission on this _____ day of _____ 2015.

Jack Hilborn
Chairman, Civil Service Commission

**City of Delaware
Firefighter Certified List (2013)**

Current List Order	Original List Order	Last Name	First Name	Overall Score (for CSC eligibility list)	Candidate Status as of March 5, 2014 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of April 2, 2014 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of July 2, 2014 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of Nov. 5, 2014 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of Jan. 7, 2015 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of Feb. 4, 2015 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of March 4, 2015 CSC Meeting
1	15	Dunlap	Mark	82.33	in process	Hold	Hold	passed over	passed over	hold	hold
2	17	Gorman	Michael	80.67			in process	Hold	Hold	hold	hold
3	18	Spurlock	Aaron	80.00			in process	Hold	Hold	hold	hold
4	19	Rieser	Adam	79.67			in process	Hold	Hold	hold	hold
5	20	Penner	Caleb	79.67						in process	in process
6	21	Anderson	Lance	79.00						in process	in process
7	23	May	Benjamin	78.67						in process	in process
8	24	Defluiter	Dale	77.67						in process	in process
9	26	Rella	David	77.33							in process
10	27	Moore	Robert	76.33							in process
11	28	Joseph	Conrad	75.67							in process
12	29	Nelson	Jared	75.33							in process
13	30	Payne	Stephen	75.00							in process
14	31	Rutherford	Jacob	74.67							in process

Hired/Removed from List/Disqualified

	4	Richison	Peter	90.67	requested to be removed from process.						
	3	Curtiss	Daniel	90.67		reached age limit					
	1	Pershing	John	95.00	in process	Recommended for hire	Hired 6/4/14				
	2	Nethers	Richard	92.00	in process	Recommended for hire	Hired 6/4/14				
	5	Theisen	Michael	90.33	in process	Recommended for hire	Hired 6/4/14				
	6	Blythe	Dylan	89.67	in process	Recommended for hire	Hired 6/4/14				
	7	Seiffert	Luke	89.33	in process	Recommended for hire	Hired 6/4/14				
	8	Drenik	Jared	88.00	in process	Recommended for hire	Hired 6/4/14				
	11	Caulkins	Patrick	84.00	in process	Recommended for hire	Hired 6/4/14				

**City of Delaware
Firefighter Certified List (2013)**

Current List Order	Original List Order	Last Name	First Name	Overall Score (for CSC eligibility list)	Candidate Status as of March 5, 2014 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of April 2, 2014 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of July 2, 2014 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of Nov. 5, 2014 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of Jan. 7, 2015 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of Feb. 4, 2015 CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of March 4, 2015 CSC Meeting
	12	Jacobs	Kyle	83.67	in process	Hold	Hold	requested to be removed from process; accepted position elsewhere.			
	9	Howard	Ryan	87.33	in process	passed over	Hold	in process	Hired 12/17/14		
	13	VonLohr	Taylor	83.33	in process	Hold	Hold	in process	Hired 12/17/14		
	14	Ripley	Joshua	83.00	in process	Hold	Hold	in process	recommended for removal from list		
	16	Hagstad	Benjamin	82.00	in process	Hold	Hold	in process	Hired 12/17/14		
	10	Nighland	Christopher	86.33	in process	passed over	Hold	passed over	passed over 3rd time; removed from list		
	25	Simon	Jeff	77.33						requested to be removed from list; accepted position elsewhere.	
	22	McNary	Christopher	79.00						in process	requested to be removed from list; accepted position elsewhere.

Updated list certified by the Civil Service Commission on the 15th day of June, 2015.

Jack Hilborn
Chairman, Civil Service Commission