

**CITY OF DELAWARE  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING  
JANUARY 7, 2015, 3:00PM  
COUNCIL CHAMBERS**

**AGENDA**

1. Roll Call
2. Approval of the November 5, 2014 Motion Summary as recorded and transcribed.
3. Approval of Fire Captain Promotional Process
4. Approval of the Fire Lieutenant Promotional Process
5. Removals and Amendment of the Firefighter List
6. Public Comment
7. Commission Members Comment

**MOTION SUMMARY-NOT RECORDED DUE TO RECORDING ERROR  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
NOVEMBER 5, 2014**

**1. ROLL CALL**

Julie Williams called roll.

Members Present: Jack Hilborn and Michael Robinson

Jack Hilborn called the meeting to order at 3:05 pm. April Nelson arrived to the meeting following roll call at 3:15.

Staff Present: Civil Service Commission Secretary Julie Williams, City Council Member Lisa Keller, Human Resource Manager Jessica Feller, Fire Chief John Donahue, City Attorney Darren Shulman.

Also present: Firefighter Joe Murphy

**2. APPROVAL OF THE MOTION SUMMARIES OF THE REGULAR MEETINGS OF CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION HELD SEPTEMBER 3, 2014, AS RECORDED AND TRANSCRIBED.**

**MOTION:** On a motion made by Michael Robinson and seconded by Jack Hilborn the approval of the motion summaries as presented was approved by a 2-0 vote.

**3. PROPOSAL AND APPROVAL OF THE FIRE CAPTAIN PROMOTIONAL PROCESS:**

Changes to the process include increasing the written exam passing point from 70% to 75%, and creating of a "Promotional Hold List". Following the written examination, a promotional hold list will be established and effective upon posting at each station. Candidates can then perform duties of "Acting Officer" in accordance with the department SOP. Upon a vacancy, the process will continue from the promotional hold list.

Chief Donahue reports he received feedback from two (2) members of his staff regarding the process. One feedback was positive regarding the process and the other expressed concern regarding the number of books (5) to be tested from and the use of a 3<sup>rd</sup> party testing vendor. The concerns are 1) the number of books required are too many. The request is to identify the pertinent reading material from the identified test books. 2) The use of a 3<sup>rd</sup> party vendor creates a concern due to their limited knowledge of our agency operations. Chief Donahue states he is recommending maintaining the same book list as previously used and is recommending a 3<sup>rd</sup> party vendor on the merits that there is no impropriety and the vendor can be provided specific SOP's.

Agreed upon corrections to be made include 1) Under Written Examination, it is recommended an addition follow “reputable third party” to identify who determines the third party. DAS and the Fire Chief work together to select the third party. 2) Under “Promotional Hold List”, the line “when an opening occurs within the rank of Lieutenants” will be changed to read “when an opening occurs within the rank of Captains.” 3) Under Assessment Center, in the 3<sup>rd</sup> paragraph, the first sentence will be revised for the purposes of rewording “comprise” and better defining the measures. 4) Under Fire Officer Interview and Review Panel, the number of Captains participating will be added to the language (5). In the middle of the paragraph, the words “With this review” will be removed. 6) A revision date will be added to the document.

**MOTION:** On a motion made by Michael Robinson and seconded by April Nelson the Fire Captain Promotional Process was tabled to the January meeting unanimously by a 3-0 vote.

**4. PROPOSAL AND APPROVAL OF THE FIRE LIEUTENANT PROMOTIONAL PROCESS:**

Changes to the Lieutenant process include the addition of the Assistant Fire Chief to the interview process.

Agreed upon corrections include 1) Under Written Examination, it is recommended an addition follow “reputable third party” to identify who determines the third party. DAS and the Fire Chief work together to select the third party. 2) Under Assessment Center, in the 3<sup>rd</sup> paragraph, the first sentence will be revised for the purposes of rewording “comprise” and better defining the measures. 3) Under “Fire Officer Interview and Review Panel”, in the middle of the paragraph, the words “With this review” will be removed. 4) A revision date will be added to the document.

**MOTION:** On a motion made by Michael Robinson and seconded by April Nelson the Fire Lieutenant Promotional Process was tabled to the January meeting unanimously by a 3-0 vote.

**5. AMEND AND EXTEND THE FIREFIGHTER LIST.**

The firefighter list is being extended for 6 months. There are 4 candidates in the hiring process with expected start dates of 12/17/14. 1 candidate is being removed upon his request to accept a position with Whitehall. Another 6 month extension may be requested at a later time.

**MOTION:** On a motion made by April Nelson and seconded by Mike Robinson the Firefighter List as presented was approved unanimously by a 3-0 vote.

**5. PUBLIC COMMENT**

There was no public comment.

**6. COMMISSION MEMBERS COMMENT**

The regularly scheduled December Civil Service Meeting will be postponed to January.

**7. MEETING ADJOURNMENT**

Chairman Hilborn adjourned the meeting at 3:45 p.m.

---

Jack Hilborn, Chairman

---

Julie Williams, Secretary

# **Proposed Promotional Process for Fire Captain**

*Revised: January 2015*

*Pursuant to CSC Rule IV, E.*

## **Written Examination**

- Standardized examination from a reputable third party as determined by the Department of Administrative Services (DAS) and the Fire Chief.

The Written Examination will comprise of 100 possible raw score points. The passing grade is 75%. The examination is used to determine eligibility to proceed to the Fire Officer Interview and Review Panel and the Assessment Center.

## **Promotional Hold List**

In the event that a Captain's position is not currently open, the Captain's promotional process will be placed on-hold. All candidates that have passed the Written Examination will be placed on a Promotional Hold List. The Promotional Hold List will be presented to the Civil Service Commission and made effective upon posting at all Fire Stations. The Promotional Hold List shall be used when an opening occurs within the rank of Captain. When a position does not open within one (1) year from the effective date of the Promotional Hold List, this promotional process will expire and necessitate a new process to be initiated.

## **Fire Officer Interview and Review Panel**

When a position becomes available, an interview and review panel consisting of the Assistant Fire Chief and up to five (5) of the current department Captains will be conducted for each of the candidates that have passed the Written Examination. Prior to the interview process, the Officers will review the candidate's history and work capability from past records and experience. The candidate will be interviewed using the established dimensions and benchmarking criteria. The panel will determine the candidate's level of achievement through the interview process based upon the prescribed number of desirable dimensions for a Captain. This grading will be done through consensus and all the rating Fire Officers will sign off on the grading sheet. Interview and review panel members shall be provided appropriate training by DAS staff.

The Fire Officer Review Panel will have a 30% weight in the process in order to determine final ranking not including additional points for seniority and education.

## **Assessment Center**

The top six (6) scorers from the Written Examination and the candidates that tie with the sixth scorer will be invited to participate in the assessment center. If multiple positions are being filled at the same time, the Assessment Center shall be increased by the number of extra appointments. (For example, filling two positions simultaneously results in a Assessment Center of seven (7) plus any ties.

An Assessment Center process will be utilized to assess the knowledge, skills and abilities of the candidates regarding position of Fire Captain. The assessment will be contracted with a reputable third party.

The Assessment Center will consist of multiple techniques selected by the fire department administration and the assessment center administration and may include: administrative competency, written and verbal communication skills, decisiveness, flexibility, human relations, management control and leadership, planning and organizing skills, problem analysis skills, stress tolerance and technical compliance. The certified list shall be in numerical order listed by percentage points received. This percentage will have a 70% weight in the process in order to determine final ranking not including additional points for seniority and education.

### **Additional Points Awarded**

Candidates are eligible to receive additional points for seniority and education. These additional points will only be added to the final certified score as long as the candidate has successfully achieved a 70% final score from the assessment center and Fire Officer Interview and Review Panel.

### **Seniority Points**

City of Delaware Employees with at least eight years of service at the rank of Fire Fighter in the Fire Department

- 8 – 10 years = 1 additional point(s)
- 11 – 15 years = 2 additional point(s)
- 16 – 20 years = 3 additional point(s)
- Over 20 years = 4 additional point(s)

### **Education Points**

All Degrees shall be at accredited universities

**ONLY ONE DEGREE WILL BE AWARDED POINTS:**

- Associate Degree – 1 additional point
- Bachelor's Degree – 2 additional points
- Master's Degree – 3 additional points

### **Tie Breaker Certified List**

Once certified scores are accounted for and all points are allocated, if two or more candidates have the same score and tie for the third ranking score, then all candidates receiving that same score shall qualify for selection under the "Rule of Three" regardless of the number of candidates.

### **List Certification**

Once all scores have been finalized, a rank order candidate list will be presented to the Civil Service Commission for certification.

### **Appointment to Captain**

Prior to appointment, the selected candidates on the Certified List will interview with the Chief and City Manager and they will determine the appointment based on, but not be limited to evaluating factors such as leadership style and overall work approach.

*Pursuant to CSC Rule III, C.*

The City of Delaware will seek a certified list of more than 3 candidates and use the “Rule of 3” for selection.

---

Jack Hilborn  
Chairman, Civil Service Commission

# **Proposed Promotional Process for Fire Lieutenant**

## ***Revised: January 2015***

*Pursuant to CSC Rule IV, E.*

### **Written Examination**

- Standardized examination from a reputable third party as determined by the Department of Administrative Services (DAS) and the Fire Chief.

The Written Examination will comprise of 100 possible raw score points. The passing grade is 75%. The examination is used to determine eligibility to proceed to the Fire Officer Interview and Review Panel and the Assessment Center.

### **Promotional Hold List**

In the event that a Lieutenant's position is not currently open, the Lieutenant's promotional process will be placed on-hold. All candidates that have passed the Written Examination will be placed on a Promotional Hold List. The Promotional Hold List will be presented to the Civil Service Commission and made effective upon posting at all Fire Stations. The Promotional Hold List shall be used when an opening occurs within the rank of Lieutenants. When a position does not open within one (1) year from the effective date of the Promotional Hold List, this promotional process will expire and necessitate a new process to be initiated.

### **Fire Officer Interview and Review Panel**

When a position becomes available, an interview and review panel consisting of the Assistant Fire Chief, Captain of Professional Development, Captain of EMS, and up to two (2) Lieutenants will be conducted for each of the candidates that have passed the Written Examination. Prior to the interview process, the Officers will review the candidate's history and work capability from past records and experience. The candidate will be interviewed using the established dimensions and benchmarking criteria. The panel will determine the candidate's level of achievement through the interview process based upon the prescribed number of desirable dimensions for a Lieutenant. This grading will be done through consensus and all the rating Fire Officers will sign off on the grading sheet. Interview and review panel members shall be provided appropriate training by DAS staff.

The Fire Officer Review Panel will have a 30% weight in the process in order to determine final ranking not including additional points for seniority and education.

### **Assessment Center**

The top six (6) scorers from the Written Examination and the candidates that tie with the sixth scorer will be invited to participate in the assessment center. If multiple positions are being filled at the same time, the Assessment Center shall be increased by the number of extra appointments. For example, filling two positions simultaneously results in an Assessment Center of seven (7) plus any ties.

An Assessment Center process will be utilized to assess the knowledge, skills and abilities of the candidates regarding position of Fire Lieutenant. The assessment will be contracted with a reputable third party.

The Assessment Center will consist of multiple techniques selected by the fire department administration and the assessment center administration and may include: administrative competency, written and verbal communication skills, decisiveness, flexibility, human relations, management control and leadership, planning and organizing skills, problem analysis skills, stress tolerance and technical compliance. The certified list shall be in numerical order listed by percentage points received. This percentage will have a 70% weight in the process in order to determine final ranking not including additional points for seniority and education.

### **Additional Points Awarded**

Candidates are eligible to receive additional points for seniority and education. These additional points will only be added to the final certified score as long as the candidate has successfully achieved a 70% final score from the assessment center and Fire Officer Interview and Review Panel.

### **Seniority Points**

City of Delaware Employees with at least six years of service at the rank of Fire Fighter in the Fire Department

- 6 – 10 years = 1 additional point(s)
- 11 – 15 years = 2 additional point(s)
- 16 – 20 years = 3 additional point(s)
- Over 20 years = 4 additional point(s)

### **Education Points**

All Degrees shall be at accredited universities

**ONLY ONE DEGREE WILL BE AWARDED POINTS:**

- Associate Degree – 1 additional point
- Bachelor's Degree – 2 additional points
- Master's Degree – 3 additional points

### **Tie Breaker Certified List**

Once certified scores are accounted for and all points are allocated, if two or more candidates have the same score and tie for the third ranking score, then all candidates receiving that same score shall qualify for selection under the "Rule of Three" regardless of the number of candidates.

### **List Certification**

Once all scores have been finalized, a rank order candidate list will be presented to the Civil Service Commission for certification.

**Appointment to Lieutenant**

Prior to appointment, the selected candidates will interview with the Chief and City Manager and they will determine the appointment based on, but not be limited to evaluating factors such as leadership style and overall work approach.

***Pursuant to CSC Rule III, C.***

The City of Delaware will seek a certified list of more than 3 candidates and use the “Rule of 3” for selection.

---

Jack Hilborn  
Chairman, Civil Service Commission

## City of Delaware Firefighter Certified List (2013)

Current List Order	Original List Order	Last Name	First Name	Overall Score <i>(for CSC eligibility list)</i>	Candidate Status as of <b>March 5, 2014</b> CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of <b>April 2, 2014</b> CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of <b>July 2, 2014</b> CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of <b>Nov. 5, 2014</b> CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of <b>Jan. 7, 2015</b> CSC Meeting
1	15	Dunlap	Mark	82.33	in process	Hold	Hold	passed over	passed over
2	17	Gorman	Michael	80.67			in process	Hold	Hold
3	18	Spurlock	Aaron	80.00			in process	Hold	Hold
4	19	Rieser	Adam	79.67			in process	Hold	Hold
5	20	Penner	Caleb	79.67					
6	21	Anderson	Lance	79.00					
7	22	McNary	Christopher	79.00					
8	23	May	Benjamin	78.67					
9	24	Defluiter	Dale	77.67					
10	25	Simon	Jeff	77.33					
11	26	Rella	David	77.33					
12	27	Moore	Robert	76.33					
13	28	Joseph	Conrad	75.67					
14	29	Nelson	Jared	75.33					
15	30	Payne	Stephen	75.00					
16	31	Rutherford	Jacob	74.67					
<b>Hired/Removed from List/Disqualified</b>									
	4	Richison	Peter	90.67	requested to be removed from process.				
	3	Curtiss	Daniel	90.67		reached age limit			
	1	Pershing	John	95.00	in process	Recommended for hire	Hired 6/4/14		
	2	Nethers	Richard	92.00	in process	Recommended for hire	Hired 6/4/14		
	5	Theisen	Michael	90.33	in process	Recommended for hire	Hired 6/4/14		
	6	Blythe	Dylan	89.67	in process	Recommended for hire	Hired 6/4/14		
	7	Seiffert	Luke	89.33	in process	Recommended for hire	Hired 6/4/14		
	8	Drenik	Jared	88.00	in process	Recommended for hire	Hired 6/4/14		
	11	Caulkins	Patrick	84.00	in process	Recommended for hire	Hired 6/4/14		

**City of Delaware  
Firefighter Certified List (2013)**

Current List Order	Original List Order	Last Name	First Name	Overall Score <i>(for CSC eligibility list)</i>	Candidate Status as of <b>March 5, 2014</b> CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of <b>April 2, 2014</b> CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of <b>July 2, 2014</b> CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of <b>Nov. 5, 2014</b> CSC Meeting	Candidate Status as of <b>Jan. 7, 2015</b> CSC Meeting
	12	Jacobs	Kyle	83.67	in process	Hold	Hold	requested to be removed from process; accepted position elsewhere.	
	9	Howard	Ryan	87.33	in process	passed over	Hold	in process	Hired 12/17/14
	13	VonLohr	Taylor	83.33	in process	Hold	Hold	in process	Hired 12/17/14
	14	Ripley	Joshua	83.00	in process	Hold	Hold	in process	recommended for removal from list
	16	Hagstad	Benjamin	82.00	in process	Hold	Hold	in process	Hired 12/17/14
	10	Nighland	Christopher	86.33	in process	passed over	Hold	passed over	passed over 3rd time; removed from list

**Updated list certified by the Civil Service Commission on the 7th day of January, 2015.**

---

Jack Hilborn  
Chairman, Civil Service Commission



CITY OF DELAWARE

To: Civil Service Commission  
From: John Donahue, Fire Chief   
CC: Jessica Feller, Human Resource Manager  
Date: December 31, 2014  
Re: Disqualification of Civil Service Candidate

In accordance with the City of Delaware Civil Service Commission Rules and Regulations, revised June 9, 2014, I am recommending for your approval the following candidates for disqualification. The below candidates on the current fire fighter eligibility list have been recommended for disqualification according to the established disqualifiers under Rule III (C) and Rule III (D) #8, respectively, of the aforementioned Civil Service Rules. If approved, I recommend that these names be forwarded to the Civil Service Commission for removal from the current list.

1. Christopher Nighland – Rule III (C)
2. Joshua Ripley – Rule III (D) #8

jld

cc: file